

August 8, 2019

**By Regular Mail and Email**

Robert M. Carlson, Esquire  
President  
American Bar Association  
321 North Clark Street  
Chicago, IL 60654  
Email: [abapresident@americanbar.org](mailto:abapresident@americanbar.org).  
[bcarlson@cpklawmt.com](mailto:bcarlson@cpklawmt.com)

RE: ABA Proposed Resolution 114

Dear President Carlson:

The undersigned members of the American Law Institute (ALI) have recently learned of proposed Resolution 114. We write both because the content of Resolution 114 is directly contrary to the position taken by ALI and because the “Report” submitted by the supporters of Resolution 114 inaccurately describes the actions and positions taken by ALI.

Resolution 114 seeks to adopt what is generally known as “affirmative consent” with respect to sexual behavior (the phrasing used in Resolution 114 is, “define consent in sexual assault cases as the assent.... expressed by words or action”). The “Report” makes clear that an “affirmative consent” standard is sought. The “Report” essentially has two components: 1) Claims about the position of ALI and 2) claims about “neurobiology.” This letter primarily addresses the inaccurate information in the “Report” regarding ALI, but ends with a brief discussion of the asserted “neurobiology” since the same claims were made during the ALI discussions.

The “Report” correctly identifies Professor Stephen Schulhofer as the Reporter of the ALI Model Penal Code Sexual Assault and Related Offenses revision project.

When Professor Schulhofer began presenting drafts to the ALI Members Consultative Group and to the full ALI membership, the drafts contained commentary and “black letter” endorsing “affirmative consent.” The reaction to this approach was strongly negative as Professor Schulhofer confirmed in Tentative Draft No. 2 (April 2016):

“The treatment of consent and associated offenses in Preliminary Draft No. 5 provoked great controversy at the last Annual Meeting and at the 2015 October meetings of the Advisors/MCG and also the Council. Many argued that the proposed definition of consent adopted an ideal of “affirmative consent” at the expense of the largely tacit ways that people engage in sexual behavior in the real world. There was concern expressed that the definition covered behavior that was innocent, and that the criminal law should not

dictate sexual mores in this evolving era.” (Tentative Draft No. 2 at xv)

At the ALI Annual Meeting in May 2016, a formal vote was taken. The “affirmative consent” approach was rejected and the following definition of consent was adopted as the Membership Approved definition of consent:

## **SECTION 213.0. DEFINITIONS AND GENERAL PRINCIPLES OF LIABILITY...**

### **(6) Definitions....**

#### **(d) “Consent”**

**(i) “Consent” for purposes of Article 213 means a person’s willingness to engage in a specific act of sexual penetration, oral sex, or sexual contact.**

**(ii) Consent may be express or it may be inferred from behavior—both action and inaction—in the context of all the circumstances.**

**(iii) Neither verbal nor physical resistance is required to establish that consent is lacking, but their absence may be considered, in the context of all the circumstances, in determining whether there was consent.**

**(iv) Notwithstanding subsection (6)(d)(ii) of this Section, consent is ineffective when given by a person incompetent to consent or under circumstances precluding the free exercise of consent, as provided in Sections 213.1, 213.2, 213.3, 213.4, 213.5, 213.7, 213.8 [reserved], and 213.9.**

**(v) Consent may be revoked or withdrawn any time before or during the act of sexual penetration, oral sex, or sexual contact. A clear verbal refusal—such as “No,” “Stop,” or “Don’t”—establishes the lack of consent or the revocation or withdrawal of previous consent. Lack of consent or revocation or withdrawal of consent may be overridden by subsequent consent given prior to the act of sexual penetration, oral sex, or sexual contact.**

Robert M. Carlson, Esq.  
August 8, 2019  
Page 3

For reasons that have not been explained to us, the ABA “Report” in support of Resolution 114 reveals no part of this history. Instead, the “Report” cites no ALI materials after 2014 and, as a result, is highly misleading.

This is very troubling. The ABA should not consider moving forward with an important matter where the “Report” purporting to justify the action is so obviously deficient. This is a matter of the essential integrity of the ABA. A vote based upon the current “Report” is not defensible because the “Report” absolutely excludes all relevant information about ALI’s actual position while repeatedly claiming support from ALI.

ALI has carefully considered exactly this issue and we have attached to this letter various ALI record documents memorializing the deficiencies with “affirmative consent” that led to its rejection by ALI. These attachments also address the “neurobiology” issue of “frozen fright.” This also was rejected by ALI which explicitly adopted the position that, “Consent may be express or it may be inferred from behavior—both action and inaction—in the context of all the circumstances.” Much more could be said about the deficiencies of the “Report” with respect to neurobiology, including the fact that the principal proponent of the “frozen fright” theory is Rebecca Campbell who is not a neurobiologist. *See, e.g.*, Emily Yoffe, The Bad Science Behind the Campus Response to Sexual Assault, The Atlantic, September 8, 2017 (“In her 2012 talk, Campbell acknowledged that she is not a neuroscientist, but rather is translating others’ work.”) <https://www.theatlantic.com/education/archive/2017/09/the-bad-science-behind-campus-response-to-sexual-assault/539211/> The Yoffe article contains highly detailed examination and refutation of the “frozen fright” claims that must be examined and assessed by the ABA before permitting the “Report” to be a basis for ABA action.

In short, the “Report” is based on bad history and bad science. We respectfully submit that Resolution 114 is not appropriate for consideration by the ABA at this time. It should be withdrawn and, if its proponents desire further consideration, it merits a fair and balanced report that will allow informed consideration before any vote is taken.

Respectfully submitted,

**Frederic N. Smalkin**

Chief U.S. District Judge, D.Md. (Ret.)  
Jurist-in-Residence  
and Professor of Law  
University of Baltimore School of Law  
Baltimore, MD

**Kathryn M. Kase**

Law Office of Kathryn M. Kase  
3720 Greenbriar  
Houston TX

**Tyler Baker**

ALI Life Member  
Carmel Valley, CA

**Thomas R. Newman**

ALI Life Member  
New York, NY

**Edwin Williamson**

Sullivan & Cromwell LLP  
Washington, DC

**Donna Elm**

Tampa, FL

**Jon M. Sands**

Phoenix, AZ

**Hon. Evelyn Keyes**

Justice, First Court of Appeals  
Houston, TX

**Stephen K. Huber**

ALI Life Member  
Professor Emeritus  
University of Houston Law Center  
Houston, TX

**Daniel S. Kleinberger**

Professor Emeritus, Mitchell Hamline  
School of Law  
Reporter, Uniform Law Conference  
Drafting Committee on the Uniform  
Limited Liability Company  
Protected Series Act  
St. Paul, MN

**Margaret Love**

Law Offices of Margaret Love  
Washington, DC

**Victor Vilaplana**

Of Counsel  
Foley and Lardner LLP  
San Diego, CA

**Kate Stith**

ALI Life Member  
Lafayette S. Foster Professor of Law  
Yale Law School  
New Haven, CT

**A.N. Field**

New York, NY

**Herb Fenster**

ALI Life Member  
Covington & Burling LLP  
Washington, DC

**Alfred W. Putnam**

Drinker Biddle & Reath LLP  
Philadelphia, PA

**Michael P. Van Alstine**

Professor of Law, University of Maryland  
Carey School of Law

Baltimore, MD

**Christopher Zampogna**

Zampogna, PC  
Washington, DC

**John H. Cayce**

Chief Justice, Texas Court of Appeals, Second  
District (Retired)  
Partner, Kelly Hart LLP  
Fort Worth, TX

**Steve Hut**

Chevy Chase, MD

**William J. Leahy**

Director, Office of Indigent Legal Services  
Albany, NY

**George Davidson**

New York, NY

**Charles Fried**

Beneficial Professor of Law  
Harvard University Law School  
Cambridge, MA

**Ronald Henry**

Washington, DC

**Henry R. Lord**

ALI Life Member  
Partner Emeritus  
DLA Piper LLP (U.S.)  
Baltimore, MD

**Robert A. Helman**

ALI Life Member  
Partner and Former Chairman  
Mayer Brown LLP  
Chicago, IL

**Kenneth G. Dau-Schmidt**

Carr Professor of Law  
Indiana University--Bloomington  
Bloomington, IN

**Brian D. Shannon**

Paul W. Horn Professor  
Texas Tech University School of Law  
Lubbock, TX

**Donna Elm**

Tampa, FL

**Kenneth C. Kettering**

Short Hills, New Jersey

**Ralph Reisner**

ALI Life Member  
Professor Emeritus  
University of Illinois College of Law  
Champagne, IL

**James B. Craven III**

ALI Life Member  
Durham, NC

**Rob Goodin**

ALI Life Member  
San Francisco, CA

**Marie T. Reilly**

Professor of Law  
Penn State University School of Law  
University Park, PA

**David Aronofsky**

Retired General Counsel and Law Faculty  
Member  
University of Montana  
Austin, TX

**Arthur D. Hellman**

ALI Life Member, Professor Emeritus  
University of Pittsburgh School of Law  
Pittsburgh, PA

**Anne Gardner**

Justice, Second Court of Appeals  
Fort Worth, TX

**Bradley Y. Smith**

New York, NY

**Hon. Evelyn Keyes**

Justice, First Court of Appeals  
Houston, TX

**John H. Cayce**

Chief Justice, Texas Court of Appeals,  
Second District (Retired)  
Partner, Kelly Hart LLP  
Fort Worth, TX

**Michael Greenberger**

ALI Life Member  
Law School Professor  
University of Maryland  
Francis King Carey School of Law  
Baltimore, MD

**John F. Olson**

Distinguished Visitor from Practice  
Georgetown Law Center  
Partner Gibson, Dunn & Crutcher, LLP  
Washington, DC

**Amon Burton**

ALI Life Member  
Austin, TX

**Manning G. Warren**

ALI Life Member  
H. Edward Harter Chair  
of Commercial Law  
Brandeis School of Law  
University of Louisville  
Louisville, KY

**Thomas R. Newman**

ALI Life Member  
New York, NY

**Ira Ellman**

Charles J. Merriam Distinguished  
Professor of Law  
Sandra Day O'Connor College of Law  
Arizona State University  
Tempe, AZ

**Stephen Lee Saltonstall**

ALI Life Member  
Tucson, AZ

**Sheldon Raab**

ALI Life Member  
New York, NY

**Nicholas L. Georgakopoulos**  
Harold R. Woodard Professor of Law  
Indiana University  
McKinney School of Law  
Indianapolis, IN

**Dianne Bennett**  
Retired, Managing Partner  
Hodgson Russ LLP  
Buffalo, NY

**Bill Brewbaker**  
Rose Professor of Law, University of Alabama  
Law School  
Tuscaloosa, AL

**Christie George**  
James B. Duke Professor Emeritus of Law  
Duke University School of Law  
Durham, NC

**Noel Fidel**  
ALI Life Member  
Retired Judge  
Arizona Court of Appeals  
Law Office of Noel Fidel  
Phoenix, AZ

**George W. Liebmann**  
ALI Life Member  
Liebmann and Shively, P.A.  
Baltimore, MD

**G. Robert Blakey**  
William J. & Dorothy  
T. O'Neil Professor of Law Emeritus  
Notre Dame Law School  
Notre Dame, IN

**Robert Newman**  
ALI Life Member  
San Antonio, TX

**Dean A. Strang**  
StrangBradley, LLC  
Madison, WI

**Robert A. James.**  
Pillsbury Winthrop Shaw Pittman LLP  
San Francisco, CA

**David Shapiro**  
William Nelson Cromwell Professor of Law  
Emeritus Harvard  
University School of Law  
Cambridge, MA

**James Felman**  
Partner, Kynes,  
Markman, & Feldman  
Tampa, FL

**Catherine L. Carpenter**  
Vice Dean and The Hon. Arleigh M.  
Woods and William T. Woods Professor  
of Law Southwestern Law School  
Los Angeles, CA

**Michael G. Goldstein**  
ALI Life Member  
Newport Beach, CA

**Joan Wexler**  
ALI Life Member  
Dean and Professor of Law Emerita  
Brooklyn Law School  
Brooklyn, NY

**William Hodes**

Professor Emeritus of Law  
Indiana University  
Lady Lake, FL  
Judge Benjamin Lerner  
Philadelphia, PA

**Patrick Daugherty**

Partner, Foley & Lardner LLP  
Chicago, IL

**Michael Zimmerman**

ALI Life Member  
Partner  
Zimmerman Jones Booher  
Chief Justice, Utah Supreme Court (Ret.)  
Salt Lake City, UT

**Robert Cottrol**

Harold Paul Green Research Professor  
of Law, The George Washington  
University Law School  
Washington, DC

**Theodore H. Frank**

Washington, DC.

**Arthur T. Donato**

Law Offices of Arthur Thomas  
Donato  
Media, PA

**William Reynolds**

ALI Life Member  
Jacob A. France Professor of Judicial  
Process Emeritus University of  
Maryland School of Law  
Baltimore, MD

**Laird Kirkpatrick**

ALI Life Member  
Louis Harkey Mayo Research Professor of Law  
The George Washington University  
Law School  
Washington, DC

**Ronald J. Allen**

John Henry Wigmore Professor of Law  
Northwestern University  
Chicago, IL

**Ronald Henry**

Washington, DC

**Leonard P. Strickman**

Professor, Founding Dean Emeritus  
Florida International  
University College of Law  
Miami, FL

**William Funk**

Lewis & Clark Distinguished Professor of Law  
Lewis & Clark Law School  
Portland, OR

**John L. Warden**

ALI Life Member  
New York, NY

**Warren Belmar**

ALI Life Member  
Washington, DC

**Ronald Rolfe**

ALI Life Member  
New York, NY



**Thomas D. Waterman**

Justice, Iowa Supreme Court  
Des Moines, IA

**Larry Catá Backer**

W. Richard and Mary Eshelman Faculty Scholar  
& Professor of Law  
Professor of International Affairs  
Pennsylvania State University  
University Park, PA

**Joseph Goldberg**

ALI Life Member  
Albuquerque, NM

**Mary Massaron**

Shareholder and Appellate Practice Group  
Leader  
Plunkett Cooney PC  
Bloomfield Hills, MI

**Robert W. Hillman**

ALI Life Member  
Distinguished Professor of Law  
University of California-Davis  
Davis, CA

**Ellen S. Podgor**

Gary R. Trombley Family White-Collar  
Crime Research Professor  
Stetson University College of Law  
Gulfport, FL

**William D. Dolan, III**

William D. Dolan, III, PC  
Tysons Corner, VA

**Allen E. Shoenberger**

Professor, Loyola Chicago School of Law  
Chicago, IL

**Christopher M. Newman**

Associate Professor of Law, Antonin Scalia Law  
School at  
George Mason University  
Arlington, VA

**John S. Beckerman**

Morristown, NJ

**Peter J. Kalis**

Partner and Former Chairman and Global  
Managing Partner  
K&L Gates LLP  
Pittsburgh, PA

**Bridget M. McCormack**

Justice, Michigan Supreme Court  
Lansing, MI

**Stephen Lee Saltonstall**

ALI Life Member  
Tucson, AZ

**Arthur B. Spitzer**

ALI Life Member  
Professor of Law and University Distinguished  
Professor  
Chicago-Kent College of Law  
Illinois Inst. of Technology  
Chicago, IL

**Adriane Dudley**

Dudley Rich David LLP  
St. Thomas, VI

**Amon W. Burton**

ALI Life Member  
Austin, TX

**Mark J. Loewenstein**

ALI Life Member  
Monfort Professor of Commercial Law  
University of Colorado  
Boulder, CO

**Glenn Koppel**

Professor of Law  
Western State College of Law  
Fullerton, CA

**Ira Robbins**

ALI Life Member

Barnard T. Welsh Scholar and Professor of Law  
American University  
Washington College of Law  
Washington, DC

**Thomas C. Arthur**

ALI Life Member, L.Q.C.  
Lamar Professor  
Emory University School of Law  
Atlanta, GA

President-Elect  
Judy Perry Martinez  
[judym@spsr-Law.com](mailto:judym@spsr-Law.com)

Chair, House of Delegates  
William R. Bay  
[wbay@thompsoncoburn.com](mailto:wbay@thompsoncoburn.com)

ABA Rules and Calendar  
Committee  
[Rules@mail.americanbar.org](mailto:Rules@mail.americanbar.org)  
Section of Civil Rights and Social  
Justice  
Estelle H. Rogers  
Forestville, CA  
[1estellerogers@gmail.com](mailto:1estellerogers@gmail.com)

Mark I. Schickman  
San Francisco, CA  
[mis@freelandlaw.com](mailto:mis@freelandlaw.com)

Criminal Justice Section  
Neal R. Sonnett  
Miami, FL  
[nrslaw@sonnett.com](mailto:nrslaw@sonnett.com)

Stephen A. Saltzburg  
Washington, DC  
[ssaltz@law.gwu.edu](mailto:ssaltz@law.gwu.edu)

Kevin Scruggs  
[Kevin.Scruggs@AmericanBar.org](mailto:Kevin.Scruggs@AmericanBar.org)

Lucian Dervan  
[Lucian.Dervan@Belmont.edu](mailto:Lucian.Dervan@Belmont.edu)

Section of Litigation  
Dennis J. Drasco  
Roseland, NJ  
[ddrasco@lumlaw.com](mailto:ddrasco@lumlaw.com)

Judith A. Miller  
Chevy Chase, MD  
[judith.miller3@gmail.com](mailto:judith.miller3@gmail.com)

Don Bivens  
Phoenix, AZ  
[dbivens@swlaw.com](mailto:dbivens@swlaw.com)

Judicial Division  
Richard N. Bien  
Kansas City, MO  
[rbien@lathropgage.com](mailto:rbien@lathropgage.com)

National Conference of  
Federal Trial Judges  
Elizabeth Snow Strong  
Brooklyn, NY  
[elizabeth\\_stong@nyeb.uscourts.gov](mailto:elizabeth_stong@nyeb.uscourts.gov)

National Conference of State  
Trial Judges  
Christopher T. Whitten  
Phoenix, AZ  
[whittenc@superiorcourt.maricopa.gov](mailto:whittenc@superiorcourt.maricopa.gov)

Law Practice Division  
Thomas C. Grella  
Asheville, NC  
[tgrella@mwblawyers.com](mailto:tgrella@mwblawyers.com)

Joan Rose Marie Bullock  
San Diego, CA  
[joan.bullock@tmslaw.tsu.edu](mailto:joan.bullock@tmslaw.tsu.edu)

Law Student Division  
Ashley Baker  
Stone Mountain, GA  
[ashley\\_baker@sulc.edu](mailto:ashley_baker@sulc.edu)

Erika Lessane  
Chicago, IL  
[Erikalessane2020@nlaw.northwestern.edu](mailto:Erikalessane2020@nlaw.northwestern.edu)

Solo, Small Firm and General  
Practice Division:  
Stephen B. Rosales  
Belmont, MA

[s.rosales@rosalesandrosales.com](mailto:s.rosales@rosalesandrosales.com)

James M. Durant III  
Lemont, IL  
[james.durant@science.doe.gov](mailto:james.durant@science.doe.gov)

Jennifer A. Rymell  
Fort Worth, TX  
[jarymell@msn.com](mailto:jarymell@msn.com)

Young Lawyers Division  
Lacy L. Durham  
Dallas, TX  
[lacydurhamlaw@yahoo.com](mailto:lacydurhamlaw@yahoo.com)

Stefan Palys  
Phoenix, AZ  
[stefan.palys@stinson.com](mailto:stefan.palys@stinson.com)

Shenique A. Moss  
Detroit, MI  
[sheniquemoss@gmail.com](mailto:sheniquemoss@gmail.com)

Anna McMahon Romanskaya  
San Diego, CA  
[aromanskaya@starkllp.com](mailto:aromanskaya@starkllp.com)

Dana M. Hrelc  
Hartford, CT  
[dhrelc@hdblfirm.com](mailto:dhrelc@hdblfirm.com)

American Immigration Lawyers  
Association  
Robert E. Juceam  
New York, NY  
[robert.juceam@friedfrank.com](mailto:robert.juceam@friedfrank.com)

Conference of Chief Justices  
Gerald W. VandeWalle  
Bismarck, ND  
[gvandewalle@ndcourts.gov](mailto:gvandewalle@ndcourts.gov)

The Federal Bar Association  
Ashley L. Belleau  
New Orleans, LA

[abelleau@lawla.com](mailto:abelleau@lawla.com)

The Federal Circuit Bar  
Association  
Kristin L. Yohannan  
Washington, DC  
[kristin.yohannan@gmail.com](mailto:kristin.yohannan@gmail.com)

Hispanic National Bar  
Association  
Peter M. Reyes, Jr.,  
Saint Paul, MN  
[peter.reyes@courts.state.mn.us](mailto:peter.reyes@courts.state.mn.us)

National Asian Pacific American  
Bar Association  
Wendy C. Shiba  
Altadena, CA  
[wendy.shiba@me.com](mailto:wendy.shiba@me.com)

National Association of  
Attorneys General  
Ellen F. Rosenblum,  
Salem, OR  
[ellen.f.rosenblum@doj.state.or.us](mailto:ellen.f.rosenblum@doj.state.or.us)

National Association of Women  
Judges  
Toni E. Clarke  
Upper Marlboro, MD  
[tclarke.ncstj@comcast.net](mailto:tclarke.ncstj@comcast.net)

National Bar Association  
Eileen M. Letts  
Chicago, IL  
[eletts@zuberlaw.com](mailto:eletts@zuberlaw.com)

National Conference of  
Commissioners  
on Uniform State Laws:  
Anita Ramasastry  
Seattle, WA  
[arama@u.washington.edu](mailto:arama@u.washington.edu)

National Conference of  
Women's  
Bar Associations:  
Marjorie A. O'Connell,  
Washington, DC  
[maoc@oconnell-associates.com](mailto:maoc@oconnell-associates.com)

National District Attorneys  
Association  
Mathias Henry Heck, Jr.  
Dayton, OH  
[heckm@mcoho.org](mailto:heckm@mcoho.org)

National Legal Aid and Defender  
Association  
Jo-Ann Wallace  
Washington, DC  
[j.wallace@nlada.org](mailto:j.wallace@nlada.org)

National Native American Bar  
Association  
Gerald Brian Gardner  
West Hollywood, CA  
[jerry@tlpi.org](mailto:jerry@tlpi.org)